

REVIEW FORM FOR CHAPMAN 1998 PAPERS

REVIEW FORM

Author Data

Author Name:

Manuscript Title:

Review

1. In your opinion, does this paper (if covering new work) describe interesting and substantial new results or does it (if a review or tutorial) cover the subject area in an informative and balanced fashion?
2. In your opinion, does this paper adequately put the progress it reports (if covering new work) in the context of previous work or does it (if a review or tutorial) properly relate new work to old and summarize the current state of the field?
3. In your opinion, is the paper clearly and concisely written? (Note that it is not necessary to include every detail to be “clear.”) If “no” to either “clear” or “concise,” please suggest possible directions for improvement.
4. Are the conclusions and potential impact of the paper (if covering new work) made clear or is the presentation (if a review or tutorial) a clear summary of the background and status of the field? If “no,” how can the author make them clearer?
5. Will readers outside of the specialty (especially for reviews and tutorials) be able to appreciate at least the motivations and general conclusions of the reported work?
6. Is the paper up to the JGR standards in terms of:

Writing Style? (yes or no)

Graphics? (yes or no)

Professionalism? (yes or no)

Apparent Accuracy? (yes or no)

Please explain any “no” answers.

7. Summary Recommendation:

Recommend accepting as is --

Recommend revising --

Recommend against publishing --

8. Additional Comments:

N.B.: Your comments and suggestions (without your name, unless you specifically agree to have it sent) will be sent to the author(s) at the time that a revised/final manuscript is requested.

INFORMATION FOR THE EDITORS

Reviewer Data

1. Reviewer name:
2. Reviewer e-mail address:
3. Reviewer telephone:
4. Reviewer fax:

Reviewer Name Disclosure

5. I SPECIFICALLY AGREE to have my name sent to the author(s) (yes or no; default is "no")

Additional "confidential" Reviewer Comments

6. Additional Comments for the Editors only (will NOT be sent to the author)